



Apprentice Wage Rates: Extent, Determinants and Implications

Arinze Udenka¹

23rd March 2018

¹ Impact assessments and learning papers from PROSPECTS field monitoring are managed by Arinze Udenka. Email: audenka@mercycorps.org

Contents

- Contents 2
- ACCRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS 4
- Executive Summary..... 5
- Introduction 6
- 10. The report addresses these research questions..... 7
- 11. Objective of the study..... 7
- Methodology and Main Activities..... 8
- 12. Sampling Frame 8
- 13. Study Design 8
- 14. Sampling 8
- 15. Data Analysis 9
- Findings 10
- 16. Business Characteristics 10
- 18. Entry Level Employee Wage after Apprenticeship Completed 10
- 19. Entry Level Apprentice Wages without Soft Skills Training 11
- 20. Experienced Employee Wages 11
- 21. Co-funded Apprentices by Business Owners and PROSPECTS..... 12
- 22. Number of staff businesses employ 12
- 23. Challenges faced by businesses..... 12
- 24. Perception on profitability by business owners:..... 13
- 25. Business willingness to retain apprentices as employees: 13
- Conclusion and Recommendation 14

References..... 16

APPENDIX: OTHER RELEVANT TABLES (N=72) 17

Characteristics of Businesses across Ganta, Garnga and Montesserado..... 17

Findings from businesses supported with apprenticeship placements 21

Findings from businesses not supported with apprenticeship placements 23

ACCRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

MOYS	Ministry of Youths and Sports
CSO	Civil Society Organisation
GYOC	Gbarnga Youth Oppourtunity Center
PYOC	Painsville Youth Oppourtunity Center
PROSPECTS²	Promoting Sustainable Partnership for Economic Transformation
GYOC	Gbanta Youth Oppourtunity Center
NGO	Non Governmental Organisation
SIDA	Sweden International Development Agency
M4P	Making Markets Work for the Poor
E&E	Employment and Employability

² Prospects is an urban youth livelihood program with a mission to empower young Liberians to find meaningful, market-driven employment or self-employment through increased skills, self confidence and economic opportunity. Prospects phase 3 ends August 31, 2020.Phase 1 of Prospects started 2012 with the second phase rounded off June 2017.

Executive Summary

1. This report provides findings from an in-depth survey conducted at 72 local businesses clustered around commercial markets located across Ganta, Gbarnga and Monrovia Cities of Liberia. The aim of the study is to provide a better understanding of wage rate business proprietors pay employees, which are classified in the study at entry level apprentices without soft skills³, entry level apprentices with soft skills, entry level employees, and experienced employees. Our study shows that business owners place a very high wage premium on apprentices with soft skill training than with new apprentices without soft skill training with later earning significantly lower wages. The study found entry level employees with the PROSPECTS soft skills training earning significantly higher (Ganta \$58, Montserrado \$52, Gbarnga \$50) than entry level apprentices without PROSPECTS soft skills training (Ganta \$37 monthly, Gbarnga \$25 monthly, Montserrado \$14 monthly).
2. A challenge mentioned by majority of business owners is the prevalence of unskilled and untrained workers within our sampled respondents. The study shows very experienced employees at Montserrado earn a lot higher at \$166 when compared to entry level employee wages of \$52. Experienced employees at Gbarnga also earn considerably higher at \$63 than entry level employee wages of \$50.⁴ Findings from the sampled businesses across the three counties show a few businesses commit funds in addition to PROSPECTS subsidy of \$70 towards stipend for apprentices participating in the three months placement. We found a few apprentices on placement supported by businesses with 15\$ at Montserrado, Gbarnga apprentices \$24, and Ganta apprentices \$17 monthly. PROSPECTS apprentices not only receive soft skills treatment but also get work experience after the three months placement, and this prepares the youths towards better employment opportunities.
3. Our study shows that businesses are proliferating at a faster pace since phase 11 PROSPECTS intervention ended mid-2017, with 28.75% of surveyed businesses newly established in the last three years. This has meant an increase in businesses employing workers between 3 and 6 in number in the localities surveyed. Findings also show a poor percentage of businesses at 50% can pay workers on time which likely impacts on work motivation and attitude to work of employees. For over half of business owners, there are difficulties with training employed staff with identified skills gaps, despite business owners commonly stating employees need marketing training to enable higher turnover of goods on sale. Only 5.56% of business employers financially support employees with needed training and skills, with 89% of employers suggesting staff have low business and work-readiness skills.
4. General perception of business owners is that ventures are profitable with 77.78% of the sample with this view and difficulties noted with 63% of businesses not owning business premises where transactions take place. The report concludes by making certain recommendations, some of which are straightforward to implement.

³ Soft skills training offered by PROSPECTS facilitators to youths seeking employment covers employability and work-readiness skills.

⁴ Wage information for entry level employees that completed apprenticeship was not collected for Ganta because it was not part of PROSPECTS treatment area in the previous phase of intervention.

Introduction

5. PROSPECTS phase 1 and 2 conducted some research on employment and entrepreneurship in Liberia with several learning papers. PROSPECTS phase 2 supported youths with employability and work-readiness training, placed youths with businesses for a three months period as apprentices and provided \$70 monthly subsidy to support apprentices as stipend. PROSPECTS program goal is that young Liberians (15-35 years) are able to find meaningful, market-driven employment or self-employment through increased skills, self-confidence, and market opportunities. Evidence from implementing the Employment and Entrepreneurship intervention during the phase 2 of implementation show businesses retained 46% of 727 youth apprentices that completed placement. Of interest, PROSPECTS 2 exceeded its logframe target of 30%, with 46% of apprentices retained as employees at businesses after completion of the three months apprenticeship.
6. Several anecdotes suggest ability of businesses to retain apprentices as employees by business owners is dependent on business financial capacity to absorb more employees, targeted productivity from hiring more employees, and other market related factors. A better understanding of factors that affect business retention of apprentices as employees after placement completion would require investigating current employee wage rates. Lessons learnt from implementation of PROSPECTS youth employment program and the application of this learning to interventions, is captured in the framing of this wage rates study.
7. Further enquiry is needed to establish how much businesses are paying apprentices under their employ and the difficulties businesses face paying workers' wages that covers basic expenses. What the working conditions are for the apprentices, and the type of work offered by the businesses after apprenticeship. The research paper enables the program to improve on how PROSPECTS support apprentices with placements, and the market opportunities available in the localities of PROSPECTS intervention in Liberia.
8. This study documents the lessons learnt from subsidizing apprentices on placement with businesses. The aim of the study is to know what wage rates businesses⁵ are willing to pay apprentices, how much staff businesses on average can employ, classification of these businesses into market sectors disaggregated by locality, the perceptions on profitability by the businesses, and type of skillsets in demand by businesses for new entry apprentices requiring on-the-job vocational skills, perceptions

⁵ Businesses here refer to proprietors supported with apprentices during the PROSPECTS phase 2 implementation and new businesses found during the field sample list update.

of differences between apprentices not supported by PROSPECTS and those supported by PROSPECTS with training and subsidy.

9. While this study is motivated by current wage rate of entry level apprentices, it is framed to review how best businesses can be supported with apprentices in a sustainable way. Are businesses in the study areas previously supported open to receiving more trained apprentices? Which skillsets for previous apprentices supported by PROSPECTS do employers find most useful? How do businesses expect PROSPECTS to support apprentices? How much financial support are businesses willing to provide to trained apprentices by PROSPECTS? The study is a wage rates study of Ganta, Gbarnga, and Montserrado businesses. The sample is purposively selected to examine the effect of the entry of PROSPECTS market intervention on employment experiences of entry level apprentices.

10. **The report addresses these research questions:**

- (i) What wage rates businesses pay entry level employees and apprentices?
- (ii) What wage rates businesses pay experienced employees as wages?
- (iii) What number of staff employed by businesses in Counties?
- (iv) How profitable are businesses from an owners' perspective?

11. **Objective of the study:** The wage rates study provides an overview of challenges businesses face retaining apprentices as employees. Key information sought is what businesses currently pay employees and studying responses by businesses on PROSPECTS subsidy to apprentices. Business owners were asked whether they had received apprentices from PROSPECTS before, how they supported apprentices financially and what businesses have done to support apprentices (with or without PROSPECTS subsidy). The sample survey will also find out wage levels for apprentices in training and employees that completed trainings.

Methodology and Main Activities

12. **Sampling Frame:** The population of businesses (meaning all those businesses in existence at any given time) is quite unstable in the long term in Liberia; with new businesses opening all the time, and other businesses closing. For this reason, there was no definitive sampling frame available, so in the chosen three geographical areas (Gbarnga, Montserrado, and Ganta) a business listing exercise was carried out, from which businesses would be selected for survey. Three Counties were purposively selected for having the highest youth density in Liberia and job opportunities. A central point in each County was identified and researchers worked their way out from those points until a sampling frame of 72 schools had been achieved. New businesses in the listing were 51 and older businesses supported by PROSPECTS previously were 21 in number. The distribution across the three Counties are 20 businesses from Gbarnga, 34 businesses for Montserrado, and 18 businesses from Ganta.
13. **Study Design:** The study design considers key commercial districts within the three Counties as key consideration for siting of businesses by local employers. The commercial districts usually have better access to road, electricity, security, and local amenities. Purposive sampling design is used to select all businesses within 15 minutes' walk or approximately 1.5 kilometers in all directions of each three commercial districts at Gbarnga, Ganta, and Bong Counties. The approach is to cover businesses cited within the market centers, which are the employment drivers of the districts PROSPECTS works with in phase 111. The study is concerned with businesses with capacity to employ staff with a minimum of one employee and a business owner, and 72 businesses were listed as population for the study during the listing exercise prior to data collection of listed businesses.
14. **Sampling:** There was an unavoidable element of self-selection involved in arriving at the sample for the study because it was known that there would be a high rate of dropping businesses with the owner as only staff of the business. This is due to the nature of the communities with high rates of the population living below the poverty line. At the time of the business listing, researchers informed the business owners about the survey, explaining that it was aimed at better understanding of wages businesses employees are paid for both entry level and experienced employees. It was explained that their business data would not be used to benefit anyone else except to inform PROSPECTS youth empowerment program. The business owners were asked to indicate whether they would be interested in taking part in the study, with those refusing not included in the sampling frame. The loss of total randomness was unavoidable as otherwise the numbers of refusals and replacement businesses would have been too high. Despite having asked at the initial stage regarding readiness to participate, 9 business owners ultimately ended up refusing to participate, and some after already

commencing the survey. However, the result was a complete sample of 72 businesses which was sufficient for this analysis.

15. **Data Analysis:** Questionnaires were coded and entered on tablets using Commcare software, analysis done using simple descriptive methods for the most part using SPSS with data interpretation and write up by the author. Structured questionnaire format was mainly used to collect data, a few unstructured questions were transformed to quantitative data. The report provides inference from the sampled population of businesses using unweighted averages. Variables within the questionnaire were categorized into sections answered by all respondents, businesses supported during PROSPECTS phase 2, and new businesses found during the field sample list update.

Findings

16. **Business Characteristics:** Few businesses (5.88%) located in Montserrado are engaged in the industrial sector of production, with majority businesses across Ganta, Gbarnga, and Montserrado working in the commercial sector of the economy. Most businesses located in Montserrado engage in commercial trading, with all businesses in Ganta and Gbarnga engaged in the services sector, buying and selling of retail products. Table A.1 below shows no significant difference as seen between the three counties, which are predominantly commercial sector businesses.

Classification (Sample)	Gbarnga (n=20)	Monteserado (n=34)	Ganta (n=18)
Commercial sector	100.00%	94.12%	100.00%
Industrial sector	0.00%	5.88%	0.00%

17. **Business Classification:** By far the most common types of businesses operating in the three counties under study are businesses operating as retail or wholesale outlets, and craftsmanship enterprises which is closely associated with handiwork. Closer study of Table A.2 shows Montserrado and Gbarnga with businesses mostly engaged in handiwork and business outlets, with Ganta showing a fair distribution between handiwork, business centers, and hospitality businesses. Majority of commercial businesses located in Montserrado, Gbarnga and Ganta are into handiwork crafts, business center and hospitality sectors.

Commercial Classification	Gbarnga	Monteserado	Ganta
Radio	20.00%	0.00%	0.00%
Business Center	25.00%	38.24%	27.78%
Hospitality	15.00%	11.76%	27.78%
Healthcare	10.00%	0.00%	16.67%
Handiwork	25.00%	41.18%	27.78%
Consulting service jobs	5.00%	8.82%	0.00%

18. **Entry Level Employee Wage after Apprenticeship Completed:** The study further examines the PROSPECTS subsidy to apprentices against wages employers are willing to offer best performing apprentices that completed three months apprenticeship. Evidence from sampled businesses shows wages paid to new employees that best performed as apprentices is less than the \$70 subsidy given by PROSPECTS for apprentices under placement. Findings Table A.3 show a higher need for experienced employees using the proxy of wages for Ganta, with an average of \$59 on offer for employees that completed apprenticeship. Ganta wage offer is higher than Montserrado wage offer of \$53 and Gbarnga at \$51 for experienced employees that completed apprenticeship.

Classification	Gbarnga (n=8)	Monteserado (n=17)	Ganta (n=19)
Average wages entry level employee	50.5	52.6	58.5
Lowest wage employee	7.7	5.4	15.4
Highest wage employee	169.2	92.3	144.2

19. **Entry Level Apprentice Wages without Soft Skills Training:** There is large positive income difference between employees that have soft skill and work experience (shown in Table A.3 above), when compared relatively to entry level apprentices who are interns that apply to learn during business work hours (shown in Table A.4 below). We found, surprisingly, that business owners place higher value for apprentices with soft skills training when compared to new apprentices without soft skills training and work experience. Table A.4 summarizes how much few businesses pay entry level apprentices without PROSPECTS soft skills training and work experience. We deduce positive value is added to youths' employment prospects when youths partake in soft skill trainings, when youths are exposed to work experience, and can write effective resumes. Findings show Ganta offers the highest rate for entry level apprentices without soft skills training at \$37, with Gbarnga at \$25 and Montserrado paying the lowest at \$15 for apprentices about to begin training.

Classification	Gbarnga(n=1)	Monteserado(n=7)	Ganta (n=9)
Average amount	25	14.5	37.4
Lowest amount	25	8	10
Highest amount	25	25	97

20. **Experienced Employee Wages:** Business owners spend more on employee wages when apprentices complete the apprenticeship training period, have adequate experience and apply soft skills learnt during PROSPECTS training at work. Montserrado businesses pay the highest of wages on average for experienced employees at \$166 when compared to \$63 paid by Gbarnga businesses (Table A.5). The minimum wage paid for experienced employees at Gbarnga is \$20 and Montserrado paid higher at \$50 monthly. We find a high variance for maximum wage paid when comparing Gbarnga at \$ 125 to wage paid at Montserrado at \$500. Findings show average wages paid at Montserrado for experienced apprentices completing placement is significantly higher than wages paid at Gbarnga⁶.

⁶ Ganta is a new intervention City for PROSPECTS and variable for wages of experienced employees that completed apprentice placement not captured during the fieldwork. Businesses located at Montserrado and Gbarnga had a higher non-response rate to this question due to commercial sensitivity.

Classification	Gbarnga (n=8)	Monteserado (n=9)	Ganta
Average wage paid	63.125	166.1111111	N/A
Lowest wage paid	20	50	N/A
Highest wage paid	125	500	N/A

21. **Co-funded Apprentices by Business Owners and PROSPECTS:** A few of the sampled businesses show willingness to co-fund apprentices with PROSPECTS for the placement period of three months internship. For businesses willing to accept PROSPECTS trained apprentices who receive \$70 monthly from PROSPECTS, we find business proprietors from Gbarnga offering the highest amount of financial support for apprentices at \$25, especially when compared to Montserrado business proprietors offering \$16, and Ganta business owners offering \$17. Table A.6 shows on average the amount of money a business owner would pay an apprentice trained and placed by PROSPECTS on internship with a business. The information is also disaggregated how different financial support from business proprietors can be for the different locations (Gbarnga, Montserrado, and Ganta).

Classification	Gbarnga(n=1)	Monteserado (n=9)	Ganta (n=5)
Average amount	24.6	15.6	17.3
Lowest amount	24.6	7.7	7.7
Highest amount	24.6	23.1	26.9

22. **Number of staff businesses employ:** Montserrado has a fair distribution of staff numbers across businesses when compared to other Counties. Majority of businesses located at Gbarnga have two staff on average employed at businesses. Of interest is Ganta that reports a good number of businesses with above ten employed staff (Table A.7). General patterns show an average of five staff working for businesses at Montserrado.

Classification	Gbarnga (n=19)	Monteserado (n=33)	Ganta (n=16)
Average 2 staff	66.67%	12.12%	6.25%
Average 5 staff	31.58%	42.42%	43.75%
Average 9 staff	5.26%	12.12%	0.00%
Above 10	42.11%	33.33%	50.00%

23. **Challenges faced by businesses:** A common factor mentioned as a challenge by sampled businesses across the three Counties is unskilled and untrained workers (Table A.8). Biggest challenge mentioned by businesses located in Montserrado is qualified people with poor motivation

to work, Gbarnga highlights unskilled workers with poor motivation to work while Ganta discusses unskilled workers with inability to pay wages as key challenges.

Classification	Gbarnga (n=8)	Monteserado (n=17)	Ganta (n=19)
untrained	30.00%	29.17%	50.00%
No qualifications	20.00%	4.17%	5.56%
Qualified but poor	30.00%	41.67%	0.00%
Unable to pay wages	20.00%	12.50%	33.33%
Others	0.00%	12.50%	11.11%

24. **Perception on profitability by business owners:** Hiring of employees is usually a function of profitability for businesses since wages are paid not only to retain employees in employment, but also for effective and efficient delivery of goods and services to clients. Business owners tend to accommodate apprentices willing to learn when sales are good and increases the ability of business proprietors to support apprentices financially. A considerable number of sampled businesses located at Gbarnga (15%) report venture not profitable (Table A.9) in comparison to other businesses situated at Ganta and Montserratado that report a minimum of breaking even with regards to financial flows. Majority of businesses at Ganta report high profitability when compared to Gbarnga and Montserratado.

Classification	Gbarnga (n=20)	Monteserado (n=34)	Ganta (n=18)
Very profitable	30.00%	41.18%	11.11%
Profitable	35.00%	47.06%	61.11%
I break-even	20.00%	11.76%	27.78%
Not profitable	15.00%	0%	0%

25. **Business willingness to retain apprentices as employees:** In our sample of businesses located in Montserratado, majority show more willingness to retain apprentices as employees after three months training. Most businesses across the three Counties while reporting making profits from transactions (Table A.9) also show willingness to hire employees that have completed apprenticeship for three months (Table A.10). The demand to retain apprentices is mainly for apprentices that showed motivation to learn during training, and good demonstration of marketing skills during the internship.

Classification	Gbarnga (n=10)	Monteserado (n=11)	Ganta
Yes	70.00%	81.82%	N/A
No	30.00%	18.18%	N/A

Conclusion and Recommendation

26. This report provides insight into business functioning from an in-depth survey amongst 72 small and medium scale businesses in Liberian Cities of Ganta, Gbarnga, and Monrovia. Businesses have for a long time been serving employment needs of youths residing in local communities-allowing youths to support families and children. An overview of the business sectors youths work in show few businesses (5.88%) located in Montserrado are engaged in the industrial sector of production, with **majority businesses working in the commercial sector of the economy**. By far the most common types of businesses operating in the three Cities under study are business centers, where services are offered by retail/ wholesale businesses, and craftsmanship which involve handiwork, which were highlighted in the findings.
27. Overall from this study - **we find that employees with soft skills training from PROSPECTS and work experience from apprenticeship placements earn far above entry level apprentices on placement without PROSPECTS soft skills training**.
28. Business owners sampled pay more experienced employees higher than entry level employees just completing apprenticeship and with soft skills training. There is a clear differentiation from the study between entry level apprentices without soft skills and with soft skills training. The general trend observed from the data shows **wages increase as workers move from entry level apprentices under training to entry level employees and who are later classified as experienced employees by employers**. There is significant income difference between apprentices and employees with some level of skill as follows: higher wage rates for entry level employees with soft skills training and completed apprenticeship (Ganta \$59, Montserrado \$53, & Gbarnga \$51); in comparison with lower wage rates for entry level apprentices without soft skills training and completed apprenticeship placement (Ganta \$37, Montserrado \$15, Gbarnga \$25).
29. There is willingness by few business owners within the sample to support apprentices with stipends during the three months internship facilitated by Mercy Corps. We also find business owners spending more on employee wages when apprentices' complete placements and are willing to be retained as employees. Key findings show Montserrado businesses pay the highest of wages on average for experienced employees at \$166 when compared to \$63 paid by Gbarnga businesses⁷. Findings from the study also shows wages paid to new employees that best performed as apprentices by businesses is below the \$70 subsidy given by PROSPECTS for apprentices in training. Whatever the root cause is, **it is likely businesses will be better able to retain apprentices as employees after placement is completed if PROSPECTS subsidy matches wage rates paid by businesses for entry level employees with soft skills and experience**. Of interest is the professional difference noted between entry level apprentices, apprentices with soft skills, entry level employees, and "experienced" employees from an employer's perspective.
30. General patterns show an average of two staff manning business at Gbarnga, five staff working for businesses at Montserrado, with ten and above engaged in businesses at Ganta. **Biggest challenge mentioned by businesses located in Montserrado is qualified people with poor motivation to work, Gbarnga highlights unskilled with poor motivation to work, and Ganta discusses unskilled with inability to pay wages as key challenges**. Majority of businesses at Ganta report high profitability when compared to Gbarnga and Montserrado that report making profit with some

⁷ We note the commercial sensitivity by respondents and high non-response rate.

breaking-even when balancing income and expenses. ***Most businesses across the three Counties while reporting making profits from transactions also show willingness to hire employees that have completed apprenticeship for three months.***

31. **Recommendation 1:** PROSPECTS re-examines the subsidy given to apprentices to align with the market rates paid by business owners to entry level employees with soft skills and experience. Wage rates paid by businesses to entry level employees with soft skills and experience should be a key consideration for the Employment and Employability (E&E) team at PROSPECTS particularly when matching youths with apprenticeship vacancies. Currently, our study findings show the rates are Gbarnga \$51, Montserrado \$53, and Ganta \$ 59.
32. **Recommendation 2:** PROSPECTS could revise the three months placement for apprentices upwards and develop a learning guide for setting learning objective between the employer and the apprentice during the placement period. Implementing this allows the apprentice to gain more experience, knowledge and marketability within the jobs market. This might require some investigation into how long on average it takes for an apprentice working in the commercial sector of the economy to complete on-the-job training. This would be an important measure to boost wages apprentices receive during placement and enhances motivation to work observed as an issue by employers.
33. **Recommendation 3:** PROSPECTS should start working with business owners as well as apprentices placed at businesses, to educate business owners regarding innovative ways of marketing of goods and services. This may mean facilitating local based business associations towards actively participating in the revision of the training curricula used at PROSPECTS youth centers. To do this effectively, business owners need to know how to motivate employees at work, as employers agree clear learning objectives with employees. Working through the private business associations that cater for clustered businesses allows for sustainability of PROSPECTS youth employment intervention using the Making Markets Work for the Poor (M4P) approach.
34. **Recommendation 4:** Placement of youths with businesses and curriculum design for training at youth centers should consider the following when designing interventions: that youths seeking employment are classified into those with and without soft skills training; including youths with experience and those without experience. These factors should play a major role when agreeing learning objectives between the employer and apprentice during the placement period.

References

Alba Topulli 2016: Real talk with Liberia's youth and employers. April 2016. PROSPECTS learning paper no.4. <https://PROSPECTSliberia.com/>

Cassie Cladis 2016: PROSPECTS learning paper no.5: cashing in on transfer modalities, learning from PROSPECTS programme in the use of mobile money and bank accounts. May 2016. <https://PROSPECTSliberia.com/>

Eli Slama 2016: PROSPECTS apprenticeship programme, a guide to design and implementation. May 2016. <https://PROSPECTSliberia.com/>

John Skelton 2016: Leveraging realtime M&E for adaptive youth employment programming. May 2016. <https://PROSPECTSliberia.com/>

John Skelton 2017: PROSPECTS results, learning and research strategy. January 2017. <https://PROSPECTSliberia.com/>

PROSPECTS final report 2017: Promoting sustainable partnerships for economic transformation 2, 14 August 2017.

Viktorija Perschler 2017: Final external evaluation of the PROSPECTS 11 youth program. May 2017.

APPENDIX: OTHER RELEVANT TABLES (N=72)

Characteristics of Businesses across Ganta, Garnga and Montesserado.

Table 1: Years Business Exist	
Average	8.01470588
Majority period of existence	3
Lowest period of existence	0.5
Highest period of existence	30

Table 2: Own other business	
Own other businesses	43.06%
Don't own other businesses	56.94%
Total	100.00%

Table 3: Number of other business owned	
Average number of businesses owned	1.363636

Table 4: Member Association	
Liberia Association of Business Owners	0.25
Not a member of any association	0.486111
Others	0.263889
Total	1

Table 5: Own business bank account	
------------------------------------	--

Yes	81.94%
No	13.89%
Own no bank account	4.17%
Total	100.00%

Table 6: Record keeping	
Proper accounts in an accounting ledger	54.17%
Proper accounts in computerized form	38.89%
All incomings, debts owed to business, salary payments owed, etc. written informally in notebook	2.78%
Only very basic- what customers owe/ what employees are owed, written in notebook	0.00%
No written financial records	4.17%
Total	100.00%

Table 7: Customer debt	
Yes	76.39%
No	23.61%
Total	100.00%

Table 8: Customer payment methods				
Direct to bank, with receipt	Cash	Mobile money	Cheque	Other
18.92%	56.76%	2.70%	21.62%	0.00%

Table 9: Local competition	
Yes, there are many businesses close by, we compete for customers	72.22%
Somewhat, there are local businesses, but we don't really compete	18.06%
No, we don't have to compete with any other business	9.72%
Total	100.00%

Table 10: Employed staff	
One to three	12.50%
Three to Six	37.50%
Seven to ten	6.94%
Above ten	37.50%
Others	5.56%
Total	100.00%

Table 11: Profitability	
Very profitable	30.56%
Profitable	47.22%
I break-even	18.06%
Not profitable	4.17%

Table 12: Staff development	
Communicate with employee to act and improve	51.39%

Send the employee away from the business until employee acts	11.11%
Send the employee away from the business as reprimand	2.78%
Accept lack of business skills and work with willing employees	29.17%
Financially support employee with needed training and skills	5.56%
Total	100.00%

Table 13: Staff with low business & work-readiness skills	
Yes, often happens	55.56%
Sometimes happens	33.33%
Rarely happens	5.56%
No, never happens	5.56%
Total	100.00%

Table 14: Ownership business premises	
Owned - Certificate of Occupancy	9.72%
Owned - Registered deed of assignment	22.22%
Owned- Right of occupancy	5.56%
Rented - Long lease (10 or more)	26.39%
Rented - Short lease	26.39%
Rented – no formal lease at all	9.72%
Total	100.00%

Findings from businesses supported with apprenticeship placements

Table 15: Business interest to host apprentice	
Yes	95.24%
No	4.76%
Total	100.00%

Table 16: Businesses pay apprentice for 3 months placement with PROSPECTS	
Yes	35.00%
No	60.00%
Don't know	5.00%
Total	100.00%

Table 17: Apprentices received without PROSPECTS support	
Average number of apprentices hired	5.1
Highest frequency of hiring apprentices	4
Lowest number of apprentices hired	2
Highest number of apprentices hired	15

Table 18: Apprentices received and supported by PROSPECTS	
Average number of apprentices sent by PROSPECTS to businesses	4.809524
Highest frequency of apprentices sent by PROSPECTS to businesses	4
Lowest number of apprentices sent by PROSPECTS to businesses	1

Table 19: Businesses retained apprentices after internship

Yes	76.19%
No	23.81%
Total	100.00%

Table 20: Challenge hiring apprentices

Unskilled and not trained	0.380952
No qualifications	0.047619
Qualified but poor motivation to work	0.238095
Unable to pay wages expected by apprentices	0.190476
Other	0.142857

Table 21: Why accept apprentices from PROSPECTS

Better trained apprentices	47.62%
Well behaved apprentices	28.57%
Lower wage bills for currently employed staff	0.00%
I needed more staff on my employ	23.81%
Other	0.00%

Table 22: Late paying workers

Paid late in the past	0.571429
I do not pay late	0.428571
Total	1

Table 23: Reason for paying late	
I was unable to sell most goods	58.33%
Had a high number of debtors	16.67%
Some unforeseen expenditure came up	8.33%
Staff wages was more than income	0.00%
Other	16.67%
Total	100.00%

Table 24: Customer payment methods				
Direct to bank, with receipt	Cash	Mobile money	Cheque	Other
18.92%	56.76%	2.70%	21.62%	0.00%

Findings from businesses not supported with apprenticeship placements

Table 25: Hosted apprentices	
Yes	76.92%
No	23.08%
Total	100.00%

Table 26: Recruit apprentices' method

Advertise in church	0.173077
Referral	0.346154
Others	0.480769
Total	1

Table 27: Challenge hiring youth staff	
Unskilled	11.54%
Inexperienced	23.08%
Issues work behavior	40.38%
Others	25.00%
Total	100.00%

Table 28: Business willingness to accept apprentices	
Yes	98.08%
No	0.00%
Don't know	1.92%
Total	100.00%

Table 29: Willingness to contribute to apprentice stipend	
Yes, willing to contribute expenses	46.15%
No, not willing to pay	38.46%
Don't know	15.38%
Total	100.00%

Table 30: Amount stipend contribution for apprentices(USD)	
Average amount	27
Amount frequently mentioned	10
Lowest amount mentioned	8
Highest amount mentioned	97

Table 31: Businesses support apprentices if PROSPECTS gives 70\$ to apprentices	
Yes	40.38%
No	50.00%
Don't know	9.62%
Total	100.00%

Table 32: Willing to co-support apprentices and by how much in LD	
Average pay	2121.43
Amount frequently mentioned	1000
Lowest amount mentioned	1000
Highest amount mentioned	3500

Table 33: Wages entry level staff	
10,000LD and below	63.83%
10,001- 15000	17.02%
15001 -20,000	4.26%
30,000- 40,000	4.26%

40.001 and above.	10.64%
Total	100.00%

Table 34: Pay male higher than female	
Agree	7.84%
Strongly Agree	0.00%
Disagree	49.02%
Strongly Disagree	31.37%
Neither agree or disagree	11.76%
Total	100.00%

Table 35: Male perform better than females	
Agree	17.31%
Strongly Agree	9.62%
Disagree	46.15%
Strongly Disagree	19.23%
Neither agree or disagree	7.69%
Total	100.00%

Table 36: Challenge hiring apprentices	
Unskilled and not trained	36.54%
No qualifications	7.69%
Qualified but poor motivation to work	25.00%
Unable to pay wages expected by apprentices	21.15%

Other	9.62%
Total	100.00%

Table 37: Businesses late paying workers	
Yes	50.00%
No	50.00%
Total	100.00%

Table 38: Reason for paying workers late	
I was unable to sell most goods	47.62%
Had a high number of debtors	14.29%
Some unforeseen expenditure came up	19.05%
Staff wages was more than income	9.52%
Other	9.52%
Total	100.00%